

# **VIRTUAL MARKETS: THE APPLICATION OF AGENT-BASED MODELING TO MARKETING SCIENCE**

by

Roger A. Parker

Submitted to the School of Marketing, Faculty of Business in fulfillment of the  
requirements for the degree of

**Doctor of Philosophy**

at the

**UNIVERSITY OF TECHNOLOGY SYDNEY**

September 2010

© 2010 Roger A. Parker. All rights reserved.

Permission is herewith granted the University of Technology Sydney to circulate and to have copied for non-commercial purposes at its discretion, the above title upon the request of individuals and institutions.



## **Certification of Authorship and Originality**

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of the requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text. I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "Roger A. Parker". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Roger" and last name "Parker" clearly legible, and "A." in the middle.

Author: \_\_\_\_\_

Roger A. Parker, UTS ID #10247548.

26 September 2010



## **Dedication**

To Anita. Without her love and encouragement, this dissertation would not exist. And, quite literally, neither would I.

## **Abstract**

Advances in any science ultimately depend on the creation of instruments that can create observations from which theories can be hypothesized and tested. This dissertation proposes that significant advances in marketing science can be realized with the engagement of the advanced computational science technique of agent-based modeling. To support this proposition, the methodology is examined from first principles to concrete implementation. The ontological and epistemological bases for agent-based modeling are developed, and the evolutionary science paradigm as it applies to marketing (for which the method is most useful), is reinforced with extensive analysis of evolved universal human behaviors, especially behavior relevant to marketing. The concept of the narrative framework is then posited. The primary property of the framework is the central role of choice as an expression of value and resource allocation. This framework then explicates the notion of virtual market, and an appropriate definition of agent derived. The computing requirements and skills needed to actually building a virtual market are also proscribed. Then a detailed, operational example of a virtual market is laid out. Called AirVM, it portrays the dynamics of the market for passenger air travel by simulating the product definition and ticket purchasing process for every passenger travelling on every regularly scheduled commercial flight in the world over a week time period – over 40,000,000 passengers flying on thousands of flights, offered by hundreds of carriers. The synthetic populations of passengers (customers) and airlines (sellers) have empirically-derived distributions of salient properties, called incidence distributions, which are described in detail with empirical data to support their formulation and parameter estimation. The computing logic and samples of the interface are presented, and the system critiqued using appropriate agent-based modeling criteria. The major contributions of the research are the verification of the ontological suitability of agent-based modeling to marketing science, the empirical confirmation of the evolutionary basis for marketing behavior, the conceptual structure for construction of agent-based models in market research, and the proscription of how to construct a virtual market, illustrated with a detailed example. There are also several contributions to the airline passenger industry that emerge from the work. Finally, the dissertation contributes another example of the application of the technique to the burgeoning literature on agent-based modeling.

## Acknowledgements

Of central importance in the conduct of this research are my supervisors from the UTS Faculty of Business. Paul Wang has had to suffer with the seemingly interminable delays as I worked at a full time job and meandered down myriad pathways leading to this final work. He is to be commended for his patience. Siggi Gudergan, who came late this particular party, has shown interest in the work since the beginning, and I am very pleased that he was able to formally participate. Louise Young, who has now moved on from UTS, was of invaluable assistance early on in the development of the concepts that are developed here. The other individual at UTS who deserves special recognition is Jordan Louviere, who first introduced me to Discrete Choice Modeling and had a foundational impact on the results of this effort.

The work reported in this thesis is, in part, the result of a research project into passenger behavior that I was responsible for while I was engaged as the Senior Marketing Scientist for the Marketing Department of Boeing Commercial Airplanes in 2002. I was privileged to assemble a research team of top class individual from around the world to work on better understanding why passengers bought airplane tickets. Many advances were made in our understanding of airline passenger behavior that are now being adopted by the broader airline community, and many of the contributions generated by that team contribute to and are discussed in this work. Cheri Jones, my manager at the outset at Boeing, had the foresight and courage to let me assemble and support the team. Richard Lonsdale (who taught me about airlines), Fred Ervin and Zhengjie (John) Zhang (who were programming masters) were my close Boeing colleagues during the entire adventure of the next six years.

Among those prominent in the effort were Jordan Louviere, who taught me choice theory, Richard Carson, then Chair of the Department of Economics at University of California San Diego, and Joel Watson, also at UCSD, who tutored me in economics and worked with me on the passenger OD demand model, and David Bunch, at University of California, Irvine, who estimated the first passenger itinerary choice model. From the University of Warsaw, Poland, the team from their Institute of Computational Mathematics led by Marek Niezgodka and with the help of Wojciech Wislicki, Jan Radomski, Kristoff Nowinski, and Andrzej Slodownik worked to developed advanced concepts of airline network analysis. DeAnn Julius, then on the

Monetary Advisory Board of the Bank of England and now the Chairwoman of the Royal Institute of Foreign Affairs in London, helped me understand the problems and difficulties of the modern airline industry, and how technology could be brought to bear on those problems. Moshe Ben-Akiva from MIT and his student Joan Walker, now at the University of California at Berkeley, contributed to the mixed logit model that is now the *pag* choice model described here. Frank Koppelman, from Northwestern, and Laurie Garrow at Georgia Tech, and her student Dan Illiescu, worked with me on many aspects of the application of discrete choice modeling to the airline industry. Dan, in particular, developed his PhD dissertation on the ticket cancellation model discussed here based on my recommendations regarding approach and data.

Finally, I owe my two friends and business associates, Nick Lanyon in London and David Perroud of M1nd-Set SA in Geneva, a continuing debt of gratitude for the forbearance and encouragement during the process of writing the thesis itself over the last two years. They have contributed much in wisdom and experience, even though they would not admit it.

A final comment on the personal point of reference from which this analysis is created. I maintain, as explained in the body of the work, that all analyses are conditional on a reference narrative which sets the framework for the motivation, method and logic of the work. Most doctoral theses are scholarly examinations of topic of interest to their creator, often crafted as launching pads for their careers in the field of their choice. And they serve that purpose admirably, establishing the worth of the individual in the context of his or her reference narrative and that of others who share similar narratives. This is not exactly the case for me. Rather, this effort is a milepost in what has already been a rather long journey. As I write this I am in my mid-sixties, and have been working with computers and mathematical models of social phenomena for over four decades. I have been engaged in the development of models of such disparate subjects as consumer movement patterns in shopping districts, recreational area utilization, racial desegregation of public schools, vehicle reliability inspection programs, and (obviously) global air passenger demand. I have developed and implemented literally hundreds of consumer survey research designs and analyses. This long experience colors the approach and reasoning supporting this work, and it is my hope the reader finds that those hues enhance its value beyond simple research and reporting of results.



# Virtual Markets: The Application of Agent-Based Modeling to Marketing Science

## Table of Contents

|  |                |
|--|----------------|
| <b>Chapter 1: Overview .....</b>   | <b>1</b>       |
| 1.1: Introduction .....  | 1              |
| 1.2: Agent-Based Modeling and the Current Marketing Science Toolset .....              | 2              |
| 1.3: The Program for this Research .....   | 4              |
| 1.4: Contributions to the Literature of this Research .....                            | 7              |
| 1.5: Organization of the Dissertation .....  | 9              |
| 1.6: Perspective .....   | 14             |
| <br><b>Chapter 2: Agent-Based Models and Marketing Science .....</b>                   | <br><b>16</b>  |
| 2.1: Introduction .....  | 16             |
| 2.2: Modeling and Simulation. ....   | 17             |
| 2.3: Reductive and Structural Models. ....   | 21             |
| 2.4: A Definition of Agent-Based Modeling .....  | 23             |
| 2.5: The Epistemological Basis of Agent-Based Models .....                             | 28             |
| 2.6: Evolutionary Science .....  | 31             |
| 2.7: Biological Evolution as a Paradigm for Marketing Science. ....                    | 37             |
| 2.8: The Evolution of Human Behavior. ....   | 41             |
| 2.9: Universal Characteristics of Marketing Behavior. ....                             | 49             |
| 2.10: Summary .....  | 54             |
| <br><b>Chapter 3: The Narrative Framework. ....</b>                                    | <br><b>56</b>  |
| 3.1: Introduction .....  | 56             |
| 3.2: The Central Role of Narrative in Human Understanding. ....                        | 58             |
| 3.3: A Formal Narrative Construct - Definition and Properties. ....                    | 61             |
| 3.4: Comparison of the Narrative Framework with<br>Brown's Human Universals. ....      | 72             |
| 3.5: Comparison of the Narrative Framework and<br>Cialdini's Marketing Behaviors. .... | 80             |
| 3.6: A Sampling of Rational Choice Protocols .....                                     | 83             |
| 3.7: A Sampling of Heuristic Choice Protocols .....                                    | 90             |
| 3.8: A Sampling of Social Network Choice Protocols .....                               | 96             |
| 3.9: A Sampling of Bias in Choice .....  | 100            |
| 3.10: Conclusion .....   | 103            |
| <br><b>Chapter 4: Virtual Markets .....</b>  | <br><b>105</b> |
| 4.1: A Working Definition of Agent for Use in Virtual Markets .....                    | 105            |
| 4.2: Virtual Markets Defined .....   | 108            |
| 4.3: Synthetic Populations and Incidence Distributions .....                           | 111            |
| 4.4: Computing Concepts for Virtual Markets .....                                      | 113            |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| 4.5: Practical Issues in Building Virtual Markets. . . . .                                      | 121        |
| 4.6: Summary . . . . .  | 125        |
| <b>Chapter 5: The Airline Passenger Virtual Market - AirVM . . . . .</b>                        | <b>126</b> |
| 5.1: Introduction . . . . .   | 126        |
| 5.2: A Brief Exploration of the World's Airline Passenger Market . . . . .                      | 128        |
| 5.3: Passengers Buying Tickets and Airlines Selling Them . . . . .                              | 132        |
| 5.4: The Narratives of the Agents in AirVM . . . . .  | 139        |
| 5.5: An Overview of the Simulation Logic . . . . .  | 148        |
| <b>Chapter 6: AirVM Synthetic Population and Incidence</b>                                      |            |
| <b>Distributions . . . . .</b>  | <b>156</b> |
| 6.1: The Incident Distributions . . . . .   | 156        |
| 6.2: The Estimation of Origin-Destination (OD) Demand . . . . .                                 | 157        |
| 6.3: The Pag Itinerary Choice Protocol Model . . . . .  | 162        |
| 6.4: The Population Distribution of Ideal Departure and Arrival Times . . . . .                 | 170        |
| 6.5: The Distribution of Ticketing Group Size . . . . .   | 173        |
| 6.6: The Stochastic Process of Ticketing Instance . . . . .                                     | 177        |
| 6.7: The Ticket Cancellation Stochastic Process . . . . .                                       | 182        |
| 6.8: The Pag Willingness-to-Pay Model . . . . .   | 186        |
| 6.9: The Structure of the Arasag State Vector . . . . .   | 189        |
| 6.10: The Dsag State Vector . . . . .   | 196        |
| 6.11: The Generation of Itineraries . . . . .   | 199        |
| 6.12: Summary . . . . .   | 204        |
| <b>Chapter 7: The AirVM Virtual Market Computer Program . . . . .</b>                           | <b>205</b> |
| 7.1: AirVM Computing Architecture. . . . .  | 205        |
| 7.2: Perspective and Portrayal: The User Operation of AirVM . . . . .                           | 233        |
| 7.3: The Customers of AirVM . . . . .   | 244        |
| 7.4: The Validation and Calibration of AirVM . . . . .  | 248        |
| 7.5: Overall Critique of AirVM . . . . .  | 251        |
| <b>Chapter 8: Conclusions and Contributions . . . . .</b>                                       | <b>258</b> |
| 8.1: Conclusions from the Research . . . . .  | 258        |
| 8.2: Contributions to the Literature . . . . .  | 262        |
| 8.3: A Closing Word . . . . .   | 267        |
| <b>Appendices . . . . .</b>   | <b>269</b> |
| A: Agent-Based Models and Computational Science: The<br>Perspective of Paul Humphreys . . . . . | 270        |
| B: A Simple Agent-Based Model: The Genetic Algorithm . . . . .                                  | 277        |
| C: Detailed Discussion of Marketing-Related Human Universals. . . . .                           | 279        |
| D: The Evolution of Behavior: The Example of Altruism . . . . .                                 | 286        |
| E: Shermer's Discussion on the Evolution of Ethics . . . . .                                    | 295        |
| F: The Narrative Conceptualization of Walter Fisher. . . . .                                    | 298        |
| G: The Let's-Make-A-Deal Bias. . . . .  | 302        |
| H: Available Agent-Based Modeling Packages . . . . .  | 307        |
| I: A Simple Word-of-Mouth Virtual Market. . . . .   | 310        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| J: Glossary of AirVM Terms . . . . .                                   | 320        |
| K: Estimating the Parameters of the Pag Choice Protocol Model. . . . . | 325        |
| L: The Estimation of OD Demand . . . . .                               | 331        |
| M: Using AirVM to Impute Observed Origin-Destination Demand . . . . .  | 342        |
| N: The Random Number Generators Used in AirVM . . . . .                | 348        |
| <b>Bibliography . . . . .</b>  | <b>357</b> |

## List of Figures

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Figure 2.1: The Ethnology of Mathematical Modeling and Simulation . . . . .                          | 20  |
| Figure 3.1: Schematic Conceptualization of an Atomic Narrative . . . . .                             | 62  |
| Figure 3.2: Discrete and Continuous Outcome Sets . . . . .   | 63  |
| Figure 3.3: Molecular Narratives and Plans . . . . .   | 64  |
| Figure 3.4: The Time Structure of Narratives . . . . .   | 65  |
| Figure 3.5: Multiple Narratives Invoked over Real Time . . . . .                                     | 66  |
| Figure 3.6: Gigarenzer's Taxonomy of Rationality . . . . .   | 92  |
| Figure 4.1: The General Structure of an Agent . . . . .  | 106 |
| Figure 4.2: Messages and Message Queues . . . . .  | 116 |
| Figure 4.3: Multiple Objects Using the Same Queue . . . . .  | 117 |
| Figure 5.1: A Simple Airline Network Description . . . . .   | 133 |
| Figure 5.2: The Airline Network in Three Dimensions . . . . .  | 134 |
| Figure 5.3: The Abstract Definition of the Passenger Agent (Pag) . . . . .                           | 144 |
| Figure 5.4: The Abstract Definition of the Airline Revenue<br>and Scheduling Agent (Arasag). . . . . | 146 |
| Figure 5.5: The Abstract Definition of the Distribution System Agent (Dsag). . . . .                 | 147 |
| Figure 5.6: General AirVM Logic Flow . . . . .   | 152 |
| Figure 5.7: The AirVM Message Flow . . . . .   | 154 |
| Figure 6.1: Distribution of OD Market Size . . . . .   | 159 |
| Figure 6.2: Daily Ticket Sales, MIA>SEA Market . . . . .   | 161 |
| Figure 6.3: Day-of-Week Variation, MIA>SEA . . . . .   | 162 |
| Figure 6.4: Histogram of MIA>SEA Demand . . . . .  | 163 |
| Figure 6.5: Ideal Time Disutility Curve . . . . .  | 167 |
| Figure 6.6: Mixed Normal Representation of Ideal Time-of-Day . . . . .                               | 171 |
| Figure 6.7: Percent of Weekly Travel by Day of Week . . . . .  | 172 |
| Figure 6.8: Travel Group Size Distributions . . . . .  | 176 |
| Figure 6.9: The Ticketing Stochastic Processes . . . . .   | 181 |
| Figure 6.10: Sample Willingness-to-Pay Curve. . . . .  | 188 |
| Figure 6.11: Example of an Empirical Distribution Function (EDF) . . . . .                           | 191 |
| Figure 6.12: Fare EDF for LAX>NRT Market. Nov 2007 . . . . .   | 192 |
| Figure 6.13: Fare EDF with Fare Class Bounds and Nominal Fare Levels . . . . .                       | 193 |
| Figure 7.1: AirVM Logic Program Logic Flowchart . . . . .  | 223 |
| Figure 7.2: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Splash Screen at Launch . . . . .                                | 233 |
| Figure 7.3: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: AirVM Control Panel after<br>Scenario Selection . . . . .        | 234 |
| Figure 7.4: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Scenario Selection . . . . .                                     | 235 |
| Figure 7.5: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Fare Edit Dialog Box . . . . .                                   | 235 |
| Figure 7.6: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Simulation Execution Control,<br>Initial State . . . . .         | 236 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Figure 7.7: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Simulation Execution Control,<br>In-Process ..... | 237 |
| Figure 7.8: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Flight Monitor Selection Dialog Box ....          | 238 |
| Figure 7.9: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Flight Monitor .....                              | 239 |
| Figure 7.10: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Market Monitor Selection<br>Dialog Box .....     | 240 |
| Figure 7.11: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Market Monitor .....                             | 241 |
| Figure 7.12: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Revenue Analysis Display .....                   | 242 |
| Figure 7.13: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Flight Fare Class Ticketing Detail .....         | 242 |
| Figure 7.14: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Market Share Analysis Display .....              | 243 |
| Figure 7.15: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Benefit/Cost Display .....                       | 243 |
| Figure 7.16: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Scenario Comparison Display .....                | 244 |
| Figure 7.17: Monte Carlo Simulation of Flight Revenue Distribution .....              | 253 |
| Figure 7.18: Actual vs. Simulated Ticketing Curves .....                              | 254 |
| Figure 7.19: Actual vs. Simulated Market Share .....                                  | 255 |
| Figure E.1: Shermer's Bio-Cultural Pyramid .....                                      | 295 |
| Figure G.1: Let's Make A Deal Game Simulation .....                                   | 302 |
| Figure I.1: The von Neumann Neighborhood .....  | 310 |
| Figure I.2: Main Control Screen for WOM Simulation .....                              | 311 |
| Figure I.3: Sample WOM Simulation .....   | 312 |
| Figure I.4: WOM Simulation Status Graph .....   | 314 |
| Figure I.5: Histogram of Forgot/Not Aware .....                                       | 315 |
| Figure I.6: Number Purchased, Low Probability Simulation .....                        | 316 |
| Figure I.7: WOM Simulation with Lower Purchase Probability .....                      | 317 |
| Figure I.8: Trifurcation of Purchased Frequency .....                                 | 318 |
| Figure J.1: SideStep Web Survey Page .....  | 330 |

## List of Tables

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Table 3.1: The Culture Family of Human Universals . . . . .                       | 73  |
| Table 3.2: The Language Family of Human Universals . . . . .                      | 74  |
| Table 3.3: The Analysis Family of Human Universals . . . . .                      | 75  |
| Table 3.4: The Recognition of Mind Family of Human Universals . . . . .           | 77  |
| Table 3.5: The Tools Family of Human Universals . . . . .                         | 78  |
| Table 3.6: The Group Association Family of Human Universals . . . . .             | 79  |
| Table 3.7: The Trade and Economics Family of Human Universals . . . . .           | 80  |
| Table 3.8: The Ethics, Morals, Art and Metaphysics Family of Human Universals .   | 81  |
| Table 6.1: Ideal Time of Day Mixed Normal Parameter Estimates . . . . .           | 173 |
| Table 6.2: Group Size . . . . .   | 175 |
| Table 6.3: Estimated Cancellation Model . . . . .                                 | 185 |
| Table 6.4: Fare Class Nominal Fare Multipliers from EDF . . . . .                 | 194 |
| Table 6.5: Summary Statistics for Typical Seed Scenario . . . . .                 | 203 |
| Table D.1: Total vs. Subgroup Population Altruism Survival Parameters . . . . .   | 289 |
| Table H.1: Available Software Packages for Agent-Based Modeling . . . . .         | 307 |
| Table I.1: Macro Statistics for WOM Simulation . . . . .                          | 315 |
| Table J.1: Glossary of AirVM Terms . . . . .                                      | 320 |
| Table K.1: Sample Estimation Results for Pag Itinerary Choice Model . . . . .     | 327 |
| Table L.1: Trip Generation Model for a Sample City . . . . .                      | 339 |
| Table L.2: Trip Distribution Model Regression Results . . . . .                   | 340 |
| Table L.3: Regression of Fare Against Trend, Month Seasonality, and Lag . . . . . | 341 |